Page 1 (Pages 1-4)

Γ	I	rage r (rages r r)
Page 1		Page 3
FOR THE DISTRICT OF SOUTH CAROLINA COLUMBIA DIVISION	1	CONTENTS:
3	2	(Deposition of Harrison Boyd Goodno, M.D.) PAGE
Afraaz R. Irani, M.D.,) C/A No. 3:14-cv-03577-CMC-KDW	3	Exhibit Index 3
Plaintiff,) 5)		Stipulations 4
vs.) 6)		-
Palmetto Health;) 7 University of South)		Examination by Mr. Rothstein 5 Certification of Reporter 115
Carolina School of) 8 Medicine; David E. Koon,)	7 8	Errata Sheet 116
Jr., M.D., in his) 9 individual capacity; and)	9	Errata Sheet 110
John J. Walsh, IV, M.D.,) 10 in his individual)	10	
capacity,)	11	EXHIBIT INDEX
Defendants.) 12)		EXHIBITS: IDENTIFIED AT PAGE:
13 DEPOSITION OF		Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 1 8
14 HARRISON BOYD GOODNO, M.D.		Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 2 22
15 ************************************		Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 3 79
		Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 4 81
16 Thursday, July 2, 2015 8:58 a.m 11:59 a.m.		Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 5 100
17		Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 6 108
18 The deposition of HARRISON BOYD GOODNO, M.D.,	19	Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 7 111
19 taken on behalf of the Plaintiff at the law offices of	20	I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I I
20 Ogletree, Deakins, Nash, Smoak & Stewart, P.C., 1320 Main	21	
21 Street, Suite 600, Columbia, South Carolina, on the 2nd day	22	
22 of July, 2015, before Lyn A. Hudson, Court Reporter and	23	
23 Notary Public in and for the State of South Carolina,	24	
24 pursuant to Notice of Deposition and/or agreement of	25	
25 counsel.	23	
Page 2		Page 4
1 APPEARANCES: 2 Representing the Plaintiff:	1	STIPULATION
3 David E. Rothstein, Esquire	2	It is hereby stipulated and agreed by and between
Rothstein Law Firm, P.A. 4 1312 Augusta Street	3	the parties hereto, through their respective attorneys
Greenville, South Carolina 29601 5 (8-64) 232-5870	4	of record, that this deposition is taken in accordance
drothstein@rothsteinlawfirm.com	5	with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure;
6 7 Representing the Defendants Koon, Walsh and	6	That the formality of READING AND SIGNING is
USC School of Medicine:	7	specifically NOT WAIVED;
8 Kathryn Thomas, Esquire	8	That all objections, except as to the form of the
9 Gignilliat, Savitz & Bettis, LLP	9	questions and the responsiveness of the answers, are
900 Elmwood Avenue 10 Suite 100	10	reserved until such time as this deposition, or any
Columbia, South Carolina 29201 11 (803) 799-9311	11	part thereof, may be used or is sought to be used in
kthomas@gsblaw.net	12	evidence.
12 13 Representing the Defendant Palmetto Health:	13	
14 Katherine Dudley Helms, Esquire	14	
Ogletree, Deakins, Nash, Smoak & Stewart, P.C. 15 1320 Main Street	15	
Suite 600	16	
16 Columbia, South Carolina 29201 (803) 252-1300	17	
17 katherine.helms@ogletreedeakins.com 18	18	
Elizabeth Bradley, Esquire	19	
19 Associate General Counsel Palmetto Health	20	
20 1600 Marion Street	21	
Second Floor 21 Columbia, South Carolina 29201	22	
21 Columbia, South Carolina 29201 22	23	
1 2 2		
23 24 25	24 25	

Page 12 (Pages 45-48)

Page 45 Page 47 O: Can you recall any other discussion with Dr. Irani 1 A: No. 2 Q: Did you ever hear Dr. Koon refer to Dr. Irani as about either what he felt was being unfair treatment or terrorist of any sort? 3 being singled out in some way in the program? 4 A: I do remember he had a, as we all did had a very busy A: No. 5 Q: Or Al-Qaeda? call night one night and, with Dr. Abell who was one of 5 6 A: No. the, Locum's (sic) ortho trauma guys. And he had 6 Q: Do you recall Dr. Irani mentioning that remark that he, actually transcribed the conversation and was showing 7 that Dr. Koon had called him Achmed the Terrorist? 8 me the conversation that he had with Dr. Abell, I 9 guess, over the phone. And he had typed it out on a 10 Q: Do you believe that it would have been inappropriate 10 piece of paper and was showing it to me. And I was, that stands out in my mind because that was something for Dr. Koon to make the remark that Dr. Irani looked 11 like Achmed the Terrorist? 12 that was different, I guess. But I know at that point 12 13 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 13 he was concerned about, about his status, I guess. So 14 he was, he had recorded that conversation I guess to 14 A: I don't see how that's relevant because I don't 15 have evidence of what had taken place. And what the remember anyone saying that. 15 substance of that is I don't recall. But I do, that 16 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 16 17 does stand out in my mind. 17 Q: I know you don't remember. 18 Q: Did you ever have any difficulties with Dr. Abell? 18 A: I refuse to answer that question. A: Nothing out of the ordinary. He had high expectations. 19 Q: Okay. But lots of attendings do. Not just in orthopedics. 20 A: That's not appropriate. 20 21 21 Q: Do you believe that it would be appropriate for anyone to call Dr. Irani Achmed the Terrorist? 22 Q: Do you ever recall Dr. Abell refusing to come in on a 22 23 23 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 24 A: Refusing to come? Can you rephrase that? 24 A: Again, I'm not going to answer that question because I 25 Q: Yeah. Do you ever recall any instances where Dr. Abell 25 don't agree with it. And I don't understand how that's Page 46 Page 48 relevant. I don't remember anyone saying that and I'm 1 refused to come in to the hospital while he was on call going to leave it at that. and someone needed his assistance or guidance? 2 3 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 3 MS. HELMS: Object to the form of the question. 4 Q: Okay. Did you ever observe any unfair treatment toward 4 A: I don't remember him specifically refusing to come in Dr. Irani during his residency at USC? 5 for me. But it would be unusual for, in any residency 6 A: Specifically towards him I can't say. It was a tough for the, other than in the ICU it would be unusual for 6 program for everyone. 7 any residency program and this is just my limited 8 Q: Did you ever have any discussions with Dr. Irani about experience at the facility, but it would be unusual for him being unfairly singled out or treated differently any attending to come running in for a resident. You 10 from other residents in the program? 10 were the resident on call. So, but I don't recall him 11 A: I do recall, yes, him being concerned about that. 11 specifically refusing to come in. 12 Q: Did, tell me what you can recall about that discussion 12 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 13 or those discussions. 13 Q: And I know you said with regard to you. Do you recall 14 A: I think any time anyone is having difficulty at their 14 Dr. Irani ever discussing with you that he had 15 job or in their residency, there's going to be a lot of 15 difficulty getting Dr. Abell to come in to assist with 16 discussion about that. I can't remember one specific 16 a call? 17 instance. Well, I do remember one time at the VA early 17 A: I don't remember that specifically. I know they had a 18 on, I happened to be at the VA at the same time. And difficult relationship. 18 19 he had pulled me aside in clinic and said that he had 19 Q: Do you recall any instances where Dr. Irani believed gotten an unfavorable evaluation from a general 20 that Dr. Abell had either changed or denied what he had 20 surgeon. And he was concerned about that. 21 told Dr. Irani with regard to a certain patient? 22 Q: That would have been during your PGY 1 year? 22 A: Can you restate that?

24

25

23 Q: Yeah. That was a terrible question. Do you recall any

incidents where Dr. Irani discussed with you problems

he had with Dr. Abell either changing his story after

23 A: It must have been because it was -- yeah. It was about

24

25

intern year.

a general surgeon. So that would have been during

Page 13 (Pages 49-52)

Page 49 Page 51 the fact or denying that he had told Dr. Irani to do 1 I remember that being a joke. I remember it being a 1 2 something? 2 funny thing that happened during residency. 3 A: I can't remember a specific instance. I just remember 3 MS. THOMAS: I'm sorry, Dr. Goodno. I didn't hear 4 they had a very difficult relationship. I had, I part of that. You said referred to him as? 4 5 hadn't seen that before. But I wasn't a very seasoned A: He referred, Afraaz referred to himself as Aziz. resident at the time either. But they had a very 6 6 MS. THOMAS: Aziz? Thank you. difficult relationship. And it got to the point where A: And I think that stemmed from confusion from another 8 they wouldn't take call with each other which was very attending thinking his name, he hadn't worked with him 8 unusual I felt. And so did other residents. 9 much, and thought his name was Aziz. It was a running 10 Q: Okay. So the difficulties with Dr. Abell were not 10 joke. And I can't say, I guess it was supposed to be 11 limited to Dr. Irani; is that fair? 11 Afraaz was just joking around and was poking fun at 12 MS. HELMS: Objection to the form of the question. 12 himself a little bit. But --13 A: I couldn't say that. I don't agree or disagree with 13 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 14 that statement. I don't know. 14 Q: Was that Dr. Iaquinto referred to --15 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 15 A: Yes. And my understanding was that was an honest 16 Q: Now you mentioned the surgery resident, the surgery, 16 mistake. And he would, you know, it was something that 17 general surgery attending and the incident with 17 I don't think anyone took seriously. And Afraaz was 18 willing to joke about it and he, you know, he poked fun 18 Dr. Abell. Any attendings on the faculty of the USC 19 Orthopedics Department, were any of those the subjects 19 at himself by putting the picture of himself. So I 20 of conversations you had with Dr. Irani about being 20 don't recall that being an unusual thing. 21 Q: Okay. Do you remember a journal club at the end of 21 treated unfairly or singled out? 22 your PGY 1 year as you're transitioning to your PGY 2 22 A: I know Afraaz was concerned about his, how he was being 23 year, so that would have been June of 2011, do you 23 treated. I don't remember a specific conversation. 24 This was what, three or four years ago now. But I do 24 remember that journal club? 25 A: No. 25 remember him being concerned. Page 50 Page 52 1 Q: Do you recall Dr. Irani ever discussing with you 1 Q: Do you recall presenting an article on Radiation feelings that his cultural differences may have Exposure of Orthopedic Surgeons in one of your earlier 3 explained some of the difficulties he was having with journal clubs? the Palmetto Health USC Residency Program? A: Me? Did I present that? 4 5 A: I do not recall that. I do remember that, again, Q: Yes. Afraaz is, is a, you know, pretty laid back guy. I A: I remember the article. I don't remember who presented 6 remember on an interview day for potential candidates 7 7 8 Q: Do you recall the journal club where Dr. Irani was 8 coming in that there was a, everyone took a picture, assigned to present an article about swimming with 9 every interviewee took a picture. And then after 10 sharks? everyone left just so they could remember they would 10 11 A: I remember the article. I don't remember who presented 11 post, you know, they would talk about each candidate 12 and put their picture up on the big board. And as 12 13 Q: Do you remember anything about Dr. Irani's presentation 13 junior residents we weren't part of that discussion at at that journal, at the journal club? 14 the end of the day. We were part of the interview day

15 and then we got to leave, you know, whatever time, four 16 or five o'clock. And then the faculty and the upper 17 level residents would stay and discuss the candidates.

18 I do recall an instance, I remember this as a funny

19 memory, that I guess Afraaz was part of the picture

20 taking process, snap a picture with your cell phone,

21 and then we e-mailed all of them to one person and they

22 threw them on a Word doc and put them on the board at

23 the end of the day. And they snuck in a picture of 24 Afraaz, Afraaz himself took a picture and, referred to

himself as Aziz. But that was as a, that was a joke.

15 A: Again, I remember the article because it was usually

16 presented every year. I don't remember who presented

17

18 Q: Which residents would typically present the Swimming

With Sharks article? 19

20 A: One of the junior residents.

21 Q: Do you ever recall Dr. Koon telling one of the

22 presenters that was doing the Shark article that that

23 article was not randomly assigned to them?

24 A: No.

25 Q: Did you know that Dr. Irani was placed on academic

Page 14 (Pages 53-56)

Page 53 Page 55 remediation in August of 2011 about six weeks into 1 1 specific instance. 2 y'all's PGY 2 year? 2 Q: Okay. 3 A: I remember that he was on some sort of probationary MS. THOMAS: If you reach a stopping point. I'm 3 period. I don't remember what the date was. But I do sorry. I need a quick break to the restroom. 4 recall that, that he was on probation of some kind. MR. ROTHSTEIN: That's fine. 5 6 Q: Do you recall how you found out that he was on some (Break - 10:21 a.m.-10:26 a.m.) 6 sort of probation? (Question Read Back) 8 A: Specifically, no. He probably told me himself. 8 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 9 Q: Okay. During your time in the Orthopedic Surgery Q: And you mentioned the phrase some of the attendings, Residency Program, did you ever use Vicryl suture to that it was clear to you that Dr. Irani was not liked 10 11 close a wound? 11 by some of the attendings. Who were those attendings? 12 A: Can you say that again? 12 A: We don't have a very big department so, I can list all 13 Q: Yes. During your Orthopedic Surgery Residency Program of them for you if you want. But that's, I mean, it was just a general feeling that I had. It may have did you ever use Vicryl suture to close a wound? 14 15 A: For the top layer, no. But yes, we did use Vicryl for 15 just been me. 16 Q: Was it all of the attendings that didn't like Dr. Irani 16 the underlayers. 17 Q: Did you ever use Vicryl suture in the emergency room 17 or was it some of the attendings? Because when you used the word some of the attendings that implies to me 18 during your orthopedic surgery residency? 18 19 that it wasn't everybody. 19 A: I'm sure I may have at some point. I don't recall. 20 A: With all due respect to Dr. Irani I feel like he was Not to close the top of the wound. Not as the final 20 21 not very well-liked by the faculty. 21 22 Q: Was this level of animosity in your observation the 22 Q: Did you ever attempt to use Vicryl suture to close the same for all the faculty members in terms of their 23 23 top layer of a wound? 24 A: Me specifically, no. I don't recall doing that. 24 animosity toward Dr. Irani? MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 25 25 Q: Do you recall any resident attempting to use Vicryl, or Page 54 Page 56 using Vicryl suture to close the top layer of a wound? MS. HELMS: Object to the form. 2 A: It rings a distant bell that there was a discussion 2 A: That's a lot of speculation. I really couldn't say. 3 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: about that. I don't remember what the details were. 4 Q: In November of 2011 did you become aware of an e-mail 4 Q: Okay. Well, let's go through. You said it's a pretty from Dr. Koon to Dr. Irani where Dr. Koon was upset small department. I think Dr. Koon is the program with Dr. Irani about the dictation of a VA patient? director; right? 6 7 A: Uh-huh (affirmative response). Yes, sir. 7 A: Can you restate that? 8 Q: Okay. Did you ever observe any animosity from Dr. Koon 8 Q: Yeah. In November of 2011 did you become aware of an e-mail from Dr. Koon to Dr. Irani where Dr. Koon was towards Dr. Irani? 10 A: Again, it was a tough program. I think any surgery 10 upset with Afraaz about the dictation of a VA patient? program is a tough program. It doesn't just have to be 11 A: No. 11 12 Q: Were you ever aware of an e-mail from Kenny Linley to 12 surgery though. But now that I've been part of two Dr. Hoover and Dr. Irani stating that the treatment 13 13 programs I can say that there is different styles from toward Dr. Irani seemed like a witch hunt? 14 different attendings and it was a tough program, you 15 know. I think they were hard on everyone and they 15 A: No. I don't remember that. 16 Q: Did you ever observe any animosity by Dr. Koon 16 expected certain things. And if they detected what 17 exhibited or displayed towards Dr. Irani? 17 they perceived to be deficiencies they would attempt to 18 A: Can you rephrase that? 18 address them. And everyone has a different style. I'm 19 Q: Yeah. Did you ever observe any animosity displayed by not going to speculate on what someone else's feelings 19 20 Dr. Koon towards Dr. Irani? 20 were about someone else. 21 A: I, it was, it was not, it was clear that Dr. Irani was 21 Q: Now, I wrote this down. I think you testified that it 22 not liked by some attendings. was clear that Dr. Irani was not liked by some of the 22 23 Q: How was it clear that Dr. Irani was, or clear to you 23 24 A: Uh-huh (affirmative response). that Dr. Irani was not liked by some of the attendings?

25 Q: Was it clear that all of the residents were not liked

25 A: Just observations, I guess. I can't remember a

Page 57

- by the attendings?
- 2 A: I can't say. It was a tough program.
- 3 Q: Did it seem like some of the attendings were, that they
- 4 liked some of the residents?
- 5 A: I think my general sense to answer that question is
- 6 that the further along you got, and this goes for any
- 7 residency, the further along you get in a program or
- 8 anything you, you know, pay your dues and earn more
- 9 respect. And, you know, by the time you make it to
- your fourth and fifth year you've worked with these
- people for a while. And there appeared to be more of
- a, a little bit more, you know, congeniality or
- whatever the word would be between those people, those
- 14 upper level residents.
- 15 Q: When you were in the Orthopedic Surgery Residency
- Program, were there any residents that you would
- 17 consider to be of a diverse ethnic or racial background
- 18 besides Dr. Irani?
- 19 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form.
- 20 A: I don't know what people's ethnic backgrounds or
- ancestry is so I can't, couldn't say. There's a
- 22 diversity in the hospital. I know that.
- 23 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:
- 24 Q: Okay. I understand that. Were there any minority
- orthopedic residents during your tenure other than Dr.

- Page 59
- 1 Q: Can you distinguish looking at that page who you would
- 2 consider a minority candidate, a resident, and who
- 3 would be considered a majority or white resident?
- 4 A: I guess. Yes.
- 5 Q: Okay. And the third year it looks like there's a
- 6 number of either African American or non-white
- 7 residents in the Family Medicine Residency Program, PGY
- 8 1?
- 9 A: Yes. It appears so.
- 10 Q: Looking at Dr. Irani, do you have any difficulty
- observing that his skin complexion is darker than your
- 12 attorney's?
- 13 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form.
- 14 A: Yes. I guess that's, it's a darker complexion.
- 15 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:
- 16 Q: You have no difficulty discerning that just by looking
- 17 at the two of them, do you?
- 18 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form.
- 19 A: A really bizarre question. But yes, I can detect a
- 20 difference. Yes.
- 21 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:
- 22 Q: I agree it's a bizarre question. Do you recall a knee
- 23 patient from your PGY 2 year who called in over the
- 24 Thanksgiving weekend in 2011 when you were on call?
- 25 Post-operative patient with a draining wound?

Page 58

Page 60

- 1 Irani?
- 2 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form.
- 3 A: Not minorities. There was females. So I would, me
- 4 personally, my opinion would be that would count as
- 5 diversity if I was looking at an organization.
- 6 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:
- 7 Q: Look at Exhibit 2 if you will please which is the
- 8 photographs of the residents in the Family Medicine
- 9 Residency Program. Do you know Danesh Ghiassi?
- 10 A: Yes.
- 11 Q: Do you know Ahmed Khan?
- 12 A: Yes.
- 13 Q: Do you know Adamna -- I can't pronounce her last name.
- 14 A: Ndubuizu?
- 15 Q: Yes.
- 16 A: Yes.
- 17 Q: Do you know Dezmond Sumter?
- 18 A: I know all these people.
- 19 Q: Do you believe that those are Caucasian individuals?
- 20 A: No.
- 21 Q: How would you describe them? Would you describe them
- 22 as minority candidates?
- 23 A: Yes.
- 24 Q: Page two, your classmates, do you know Feneisha Fervil?
- 25 A: I know everyone on the page.

- 1 A: You would have to give me more specifics. You
- understand we saw like 15 to 20 consults per call. So
- 3 average that over three years.
- 4 Q: Do you recall being on call Thanksgiving weekend 2011
- 5 on Sunday?
- 6 A: I would have to look at the call schedule. It was
- standard for the junior level residents to be on for
- 8 holidays. So I'm sure I was on at some point during
- Thanksgiving weekend.
- 10 Q: Do you recall a patient where you -- or let me back
- this up. Do you recall a time when Dr. Irani over the
- Thanksgiving weekend was on call on a Saturday and you
- were on call the following day on a Sunday?
- 14 A: If we're getting into specifics I don't remember
- 15 exactly which days. But I do remember being on
- 16 Thanksgiving weekend only because it would have been
- standard for the junior level, the second years to be
- on call for a holiday weekend.
- 19 Q: Okay. Do you recall meeting at that time with
- 20 Dr. Hoover about a patient of Dr. Koon's who called in
 - over the weekend with a knee, potential knee infection
- 22 post-op?
- 23 A: I don't remember that specifically. Now that you
- 24 mention that I do remember getting a page in the OR at
- 25 the VA at some point, presumably after the fact about

Page 16 (Pages 61-64)

Page 63

Page 64

Page 61

- this patient. But I don't remember the details.
- 2 Q: Okay.
- 3 A: Other than there was a post-op patient with a wound
- 4 complaint.
- 5 Q: What did you do in response to the page?
- 6 A: I don't remember.
- 7 Q: Do you recall coming to a meeting at Palmetto Health
- 8 Richland with Dr. Hoover?
- 9 A: No.
- 10 O: And Dr. Irani to discuss that?
- 11 A: I don't.
- 12 Q: You don't? What stands out in your mind about
- 13 receiving that page?
- 14 A: I remember being concerned because it was a post-op
- patient. It was in the operating room. We were, I was
- clearly not scrubbed in at the time so I don't know if
- the case was beginning or ending. But I remember any
- time there was a post-op, you know, patient that was
- obviously a higher level of concern. So I was hoping I
- 20 hadn't done something wrong or that was, you know,
- 21 something wasn't wrong. But I honestly do not remember
- 22 the specifics.
- 23 Q: Okay. Did you work at the VA on a Sunday?
- 24 A: I would have to look at the call schedule. I don't
- 25 remember. All I remember is being on Thanksgiving

1 Q: Okay. Do you recall what you told that patient in

- 1 Q. Okay. Do you recall what you told that patient i
- terms of what your advice to him or her was?
- 3 A: I don't remember specifically.
- 4 Q: Okay. If a patient called in post-operatively and had
- 5 drainage coming from a wound from a knee operation,
- 6 what would you have told that patient?
- 7 A: My specific policy on anyone calling in to the call
- 8 pager whether it was in orthopedics or in family
- 9 medicine I can't make a diagnosis over the phone. The
- safest thing to do is to come in to the ED to be
- evaluated. That would be my general response to any
- patient. Again, I don't remember the specifics of what
- I would have said to a patient two or three years ago.
- 14 Q: Do you recall a situation where you gave that advice to
- the patient and the patient decided not to come in to
- the ED that day?
- 17 A: Again, I don't remember the specifics. I do remember
- this case. But I do not remember the specifics of what
- 19 I would have said on a random phone conversation three
- 20 years ago.
- 21 Q: Do you recall discussions with Dr. Irani about this
- 22 particular patient?
- 23 A: I'm sure we would have discussed it. I don't remember
 - specifics about a discussion we had.
- 25 Q: Okay. Do you, in your recollection of this, do you

Page 62

- weekend and we covered both hospitals at the time.
- 2 Q: But were you in the OR with Dr. Eady on a Sunday at the
- 3 VA
- 4 A: No. It wouldn't have been on a Sunday. This would be
- 5 during the week would be my recollection. But again, I
- 6 can't say for sure.
- 7 Q: Do you recall Dr. Koon chewing you out about this
- 8 particular patient with a knee infection, post-op knee
- 9 infection?
- 10 A: I don't remember that specifically.
- 11 Q: Did Dr. Koon ever chew you out?
- 12 A: I'm sure at one time or another he probably was upset
- with, you know, any resident. Yes. He was upset with
- 14 me before.
- 15 Q: Okay. Do you ever recall a knee patient who called in
- to the hospital and spoke to Dr. Irani first and then
- 17 later called you back the next day and then later had
- 18 to come in to the hospital to have a knee irrigated or
- washed out and treated for an infection?
- 20 A: The case that we're discussing, yes, did involve Dr.
- 21 Irani and me. I do remember that. I don't remember
- the specifics other than we both were involved. Both
- 23 were paged. I don't remember what was said. I know it
- 24 was any time there was a post-op patient it was
- definitely higher, higher risk.

- believe that your conversation, phone conversation with
- this patient was similar to Dr. Irani's telephone
- 3 conversation with this patient?
- 4 A: I couldn't say.
- 5 Q: Did you get written up in response, in regard to this
- 6 particular patient?
- 7 A: What do you mean written up?
- 8 Q: Did you get placed on academic remediation because of
- this patient?
- 10 A: No
- 11 Q: Did you have any disciplinary action taken against you
- with regard to this patient?
- 13 A: As far as I recall, no.
- 14 Q: Okay. Do you recall speaking with Dr. Irani on
- December 5th 2011 around 6:15 or 6:30 in the cafeteria?
- 16 A: No.
- 17 Q: Do you recall a time seeing Dr. Irani in the cafeteria
- 18 late in the evening or I guess early in the evening
- 19 where he appeared to be upset about a faculty meeting
- that he had attended?
- 21 A: I don't remember that specifically, no. That specific
- 22 instance, no.
- 23 Q: Do you ever remember having discussions with Dr. Irani
- 24 about a situation where he was called in to a faculty
- 25 meeting at the Orthopedic Surgery Department?

Page 65

- 1 A: Specifically, no. But I'm sure he would have had a
- faculty meeting.
- 3 Q: How many times did you get called in to faculty
- meetings during your residency? 4
- A: Once. 5
- 6 O: When was that?
- 7 A: Probably this, it would have been summer of my second
- year going into my third year. Or sometime towards the
- end of my second year would be my guess.
- 10 Q: Okay.
- 11 A: End of, would have been 2012, I guess.
- 12 Q: Was that a memorable experience for you?
- 13 A: Yes.
- 14 Q: Tell me what happened during that faculty meeting.
- 15 A: If the faculty had concerns about any deficiencies that
- they detected they would call you first to, they would
- 17 address it personally, have the chief residents address
- 18 it, I don't know in which order. But if there were
- still deficiencies they detected, or they felt were 19
- 20 present, they would call you in to a faculty meeting.
- 21 All the faculty would be present. Upper level resident
- 22 would be involved. For me it was Kenny Linley. And
- 23 they would go over what they felt you needed to improve
- 24
- 25 Q: Okay. Were you informed of these deficiencies or the

- Page 67
- 1 remember if he asked me during the meeting. But he did
- 2 ask me that at some point around that time.
- 3 Q: Did Dr. Koon ask you if you were recording the meeting?
- 4 A: I'm sorry?
- 5 Q: Did Dr. Koon ask you if you were recording the meeting?
- 6 A: I don't recall. That would have been an unusual
- question. I don't remember that.
- 8 Q: Did Dr. Koon ask you to put your phone on the table
- before the meeting started?
- 10 A: I don't recall.
- 11 Q: Did any, do you recall any other faculty members
- 12 discussing with you the alleged deficiencies besides
- Dr. Koon?
- 14 A: In my case?
- 15 Q: Yes.
- 16 A: Yes.

24

- 17 Q: Okay. Who else do you recall being involved in that
- 18 discussion?
- 19 A: I mean, it was kind of a round table discussion. So
- most of them probably would have chimed in. I remember
- 21 Kenny Linley speaking. I remember Dr. Mazoue speaking.
- Q: Do you recall whose patient this was? 22
- 23 MS. HELMS: Object to the form of the question.
 - MS. THOMAS: Object to the form.
- 25 A: It wasn't regarding a specific patient for me. It was

Page 66

- how I needed to improve.
 - BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:
 - Q: Were there any specific patient encounters that were

Page 68

- addressed during the faculty meeting?
- A: Not that I can recall but I couldn't say.
- 6 Q: Was there some specific event that prompted your senior
- resident to speak with you, then later you be summoned
- to the faculty meeting? 8
- A: I think there was an overall concern for me as to did I
 - really want to be a surgical resident. That was the 10
 - 11 bottom line for me. I had just had a son. And my
 - motivation and perspective had drastically changed. 12
 - But I feel that in my case they were correct in the 13
 - 14 fact that they did not, they needed to hear from me
 - 15 that I was dedicated to be continuing in surgical
 - residency in my case.
 - Q: Now, when was your child born?
 - A: May XX (redacted) 2012.
 - 19 Q: That was your first child?
 - MS. THOMAS: I'm sorry. Can we redact the child's 20
 - 21 birthday so we don't have to, I mean, can we agree to
 - 22 take it off, we don't need to have that in the
 - 23 transcript.
 - 24 MR. ROTHSTEIN: Do you think somebody's going to
 - 25 steal a two-year-old's --

nature of these alleged deficiencies by your senior

- resident prior to the faculty meeting?
- 2
- 3 A: Yes.
- 4 Q: Did you offer an explanation or did you have
- discussions with your senior resident about sort of
- your side of the story before the faculty meeting? 6
- conversations.
- 9 Q: Were there things brought up during the faculty meeting

7 A: I'm sure I would have. I don't remember the specific

- 10 that were new to you that you had never heard about
- 11 before? Allegations of deficiencies?
- 12 A: I disagreed with some of them. Yes.
- 13 Q: Were you given an opportunity during the faculty 14 meeting to explain or discuss things from your
- perspective? 15
- 16 A: Yes.
- 17 Q: Did you feel like you were being cross-examined by
- Dr. Koon during that faculty meeting? 18
- 19 A: No.
- 20 Q: Did Dr. Koon ever raise his voice toward you during
- that faculty meeting?
- 22 A: Not that I recall.
- 23 Q: Did Dr. Koon ask you if you wanted to continue in the
- residency program during the faculty meeting?
- 25 A: I remember him asking me that at one point. I don't

Page 18 (Pages 69-72)

Page 69 1 A: Just to go through identify theft to say that's a yeah. 1 officially requested leave. It was, my understanding It was May of 2012. If we can, I would request that as 2 was it was just kind of a courtesy because it was well. Thank you. 3 paternal. Obviously my wife requested officially and MS. THOMAS: Okay. got three months off. And I don't know if it was an 4 4 5 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 5 official thing. I don't recall ever signing anything. 6 Q: That's fine. It was just a courtesy because you were the dad and 6 A: Literally just two weeks ago went through identify that's not, you know, obviously not as important as the 7 8 mom being off. Q: Who told you that it was not as important for the dad 9 Q: In relation to your child's birth, how soon was the faculty meeting after that? to be off? 10 10 11 A: It would have been some months later. Again, I don't 11 A: That was my impression of the situation. remember specifically. If I recall it was sometime in 12 MS. HELMS: Objection to the form of the question. 12 13 the summer. 13 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 14 Q: Did you request FMLA time to be with your newborn 14 Q: Okay. 15 A: That was my impression of the situation. 15 child? 16 A: Yes. 16 Q: Tell me what research paper you presented at Kimbrough 17 Q: How much time off did you get? 17 Moore Day that year. 18 A: In my second year it would have been about receive 18 A: Standard was one week across the hospital. But that cephalomedullary nails in hip fractures. So it was 19 was, my understanding was a courtesy thing. I don't 19 20 recall it being official policy. I have no idea if it about hip fractures essentially. 21 was official or not. 21 Q: Was that a final project that you had completed? 22 Q: Okay. Did you ask for more than one week? A: It was actually a multi-center project. So I was 23 A: No. 23 basically one of many just presenting the findings from 24 Q: Did you get the day off the day your child was born? 24 our hospital. 25 A: I did. I was actually on call. And my fellow 25 Q: Okay. How long was your presentation? Page 70 Page 72 residents helped me out and took the call for me. 1 A: I don't remember. 2 Q: Do you recall whether or can you tell me what Kimbrough Q: Was this a final project or were you giving a Moore Day is? presentation on ongoing research, like a status update? 4 A: It's a research, annual research day. Every resident 4 A: I can't say. I did not continue working on it after presents the research they've been doing for the the fact. I'm sure I could have continued but I moved 5 previous year. on to something else for the next year doing some ACL 7 Q: In May of 2012, did you participate in the Kimbrough research. So I could have continued it I guess. I 7 Moore Day? don't know. 9 A: I did. Q: Is there time during your PGY 1 or PGY 2 year to do 10 Q: Did that Kimbrough Moore Day coincide with the day your 10 extensive research in orthopedics? child was born? 11 A: I know there was always a dedicated research time. 11 They even had research months. I would have to look at 12 A: No. 12 13 Q: Did you request to be excused from Kimbrough Moore Day the schedule. I don't remember specifically. 13 14 in connection with the birth of your child? 14 Q: So tell me again. When you request, who did you 15 request to sort of skip the Kimbrough Moore Day so you

15 A: It had happened, the birth had been earlier in the

16 week. I did ask to be excused and present at a later

17 date. And I was asked to reconsider because there were

guests coming in from out of town. There was a 18

19 special, you know, speaker. And all the faculty and,

20 you know, a lot of people were going to be there and

21 was asked to come in.

22 Q: So Kimbrough Moore Day fell within the time between the

23 birth of your child and the week you had requested

leave; is that right?

25 A: Yes. Again I don't know if I specifically like

21 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:

could be with your wife and child?

would have asked him first.

22 Q: That was Kenny Linley at the time?

So I guess that would make sense.

MS. THOMAS: Object to the form.

18 A: I probably would have gone through the chief resident

A: No. That would have been Justin Hoover, I guess. I

just remember him being the upper level at the time.

because that was the standard hierarchy. So I probably

16

17

20

24

Page 19 (Pages 73-76)

Page 75 Page 73 1 Q: Was Hoover receptive to you -- or first of all, had couldn't say. 1 Hoover approved your one-week leave surrounding the 2 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 3 birth of your child? Q: Now you mentioned the candidate interview situation. I 4 A: Again, it wasn't an official request so there was no think you talked about the pictures that were posted. Do you recall a meeting the day before the candidate approval to be given. It was, we're going to help you 5 5 interviews on December 8th of 2011 at Jillian's 6 out this week. And I remember asking him later in the 6 7 week if I could, you know, potentially skip that. And Restaurant in Columbia? 8 honestly in hindsight that was probably partially 8 A: I don't remember that specifically. We always had a pre-interview dinner the night before at Jillian's. 9 because I hate public speaking. And, but the research 10 was done though. I had nothing else to do. I had 10 And nothing changed. That was the same. We had two interview days per year. And we always had the dinners 11 already completed the project. So it would have been 11 12 very easy for me to go. I was in and out in under an 12 at Jillian's. 13 hour. In the whole scheme of things it didn't affect 13 Q: Do you recall during one of those dinners Dr. Irani 14 me at all. At the time I do recall being upset about 14 having a discussion with Dr. Nathe about a trauma 15 15 patient? it but it was not anything official, you know. There 16 was no, I don't recall signing any request paperwork or 16 A: No. 17 anything official. 17 O: Do you know anything about trauma patient female 375? 18 A: No. 18 Q: Was Hoover supportive of you taking, or missing 19 Kimbrough Moore Day? Was he agreeable to that? 19 Q: Were you involved in the care of a trauma patient 20 A: He's a father himself. I'm sure he was, you know, 20 female 375? empathetic. But I do recall him encouraging me because 21 A: I took care of a lot of trauma patients. I know what 21 22 I had already done the work to go and kind of show off 22 you are referring to. I was not involved in the case 23 or the patient. I can't speculate on anything. 23 what you had done. It was felt to be a good project. And I remember getting a positive response about it. 24 Everything I heard was hearsay. So I don't trust 25 hearsay. 25 Q: Well, who told you that they had guests coming, this Page 74 Page 76 has been planned, we need to be there? Was that 1 Q: During your, I guess during your first half of your PGY Hoover? 2 year, if you were on call and a patient came in with 2 3 A: I remember speaking with Hoover about it and then 3 multiple open fractures, do you believe that that was something at that level of training that you could have 4 Dr. Koon about it. 5 Q: Did Dr. Koon and Dr. Hoover have the same, or did they managed completely by yourself? 6 express to you the same recommendation or decision 6 A: Can you rephrase that? about that? 7 Q: Yeah. If you were on call and a trauma patient came in 7 8 A: Again, the suggestion was that I should be there. And with multiple open fractures while you were still in that they would do everything they could just to get me 9 your early PGY 2 year, do you believe that is the type 10 in and out. They even offered for me to able to 10 of patient you could have managed by yourself? 11 present first which I, even though I was, you know, MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 11 12 upset about it at the time I remember being A: I personally would have been nervous about that. But 13 appreciative of that. And it was very unusual they I'm kind of a nervous guy anyway. So I, you know, 13 14 actually did let me leave as soon as my presentation 14 manage. It depends upon how you define manage. 15 was done which was not standard. So I was appreciative 15 Clearly as an early 2 you would have been preparing 16 of the fact that they did make concessions which is, them for the operating room and that was standard. So 16 would be unusual for any resident I would say. 17 17 you would have been expected to triage the patient in 18 Q: And shortly after that they called you in to the 18 the trauma bay and check out to your senior resident if 19 faculty meeting and questioned your commitment to the 19 it was a USC call day or to the Premier attending 20 program or dedication to the program? 20 directly if it was a Premier day unless there was a 21 MS. HELMS: Objection to the form of the question. 21 senior resident on Premier. And then you would have 22 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 22 probably have called them I guess. But there was 23 23 A: I don't remember. Again, I would have to look at the always a protocol in place. But yeah, I mean, manage,

24

25

if that's including fracture management in the

operating room, no. I mean, as a 2 you wouldn't have

24

date of the faculty meeting. I don't remember. And

I'm not sure if the two were connected or not. I

Page 20 (Pages 77-80)

Page 77 Page 79 been ready to operate on your own. sometimes that would change. 1 2 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 2 Q: Would you generally swap rotations with your 3 Q: Okay. If you felt like the situation, I mean, as a PGY co-resident? Like you were away from Palmetto Health 3 2 you're still very early on in your learning curve in Richland the first half, Dr. Irani was on the 4 the program; is that fair to say? orthopedic service? And then the second half you were 5 6 A: Correct. expected to sort of switch positions? 7 Q: So the standard of care for a PGY 2 orthopedic resident A: In general, yes. But again, I would have to look at is different than the standard for a PGY 3; would you the specific schedule for Dr. Irani. agree with that? Q: When Dr. Irani came back from his suspension do you MS. HELMS: Object to the form of the question. 10 10 recall where he was assigned? 11 A: I would disagree with that. 11 A: I don't. 12 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 12 Q: Was he assigned at the VA or was he assigned to 13 Q: Okay. What about the difference in the standard of Richland? 14 care between a PGY 2 and a PGY 4? Is there a 14 A: I don't remember. 15 difference in the standard of care expected of a PGY 2 15 Q: Do you recall seeing Dr. Irani more frequently when he 16 resident versus a PGY 4 resident? 16 came back from his suspension than the time when you 17 A: Naturally in any program you would be expected to be 17 were at the VA and he was at Palmetto Health Richland? 18 more proficient as you moved on in your training. One 18 A: I don't remember exactly. I'm sure he would have been 19 would be a junior level, one would be a senior. That's 19 based at Richland though when he came back from his 20 why I said the PGY 2 and 3, you would probably be more 20 probation or his suspension. 21 comfortable managing it. But you would still be MS. HELMS: Can we take just a real quick break if 21 22 considered a junior resident checking out to another 22 it's a good time? 23 level resident. As a 4, I mean, you wouldn't be seeing MR. ROTHSTEIN: That's fine. 23 24 that, that just wouldn't happen. You wouldn't be 24 (Break - 11:02 a.m.-11:05 a.m.) 25 seeing that on your own anyways. Like there would have 25 (Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 3 was marked for identification Page 78 Page 80 been a junior under you at least laying eyes on the 1 purposes.) 2 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 2 patient and then contacting someone if, you know, when 3 you were ready to check out. So I always felt very Q: Dr. Goodno, I'm going to hand you Exhibit 3 and ask you to take a look at that a second. That was the packet 4 comfortable calling my seniors. 5 Q: Do you recall after you came back from the VA, I guess of information your attorney provided to me a few 5 it would have been after the first of the year of 2012, minutes ago. Can you look through there and tell me if 6 sort of the latter part of your PGY 2 year, do you 7 you believe that that's a copy of your response to the 7 recall Dr. Irani being on suspension or just not being subpoena duces tecum documents? 8 there? A: Is this what I provided? Is that what you mean?

- 10 A: I do recall that. Yes.
- 11 Q: Okay. How did you find out that Dr. Irani was, had
- been suspended from the program? 12
- 13 A: I don't recall specifics. I'm sure, again, as we were 14 friends I'm sure he was updating me along the way.
- 15 Q: Do you recall at that time when you, so you were at the
- VA until what, the end of the year, the end of 2011? 16
- 17 A: If I recall, yeah. I would have been there. It was a
- three-month block. So it would have been October, 18
- 19 November, December if I recall.
- 20 Q: Okay. And then once you finished at the VA, what was
- 21 Dr. Irani supposed to do the next, or what were y'all
- supposed to do in the second half of the year? 22
- 23 A: It was pre-assigned. So I don't, I don't remember.
- Sometimes it changed. But I don't, I mean, it would
- 25 have been whatever was on his schedule. And again,

- 10 Q: Yes. Is that what you provided to Ms. Dudley Helms in
- 11 response to my subpoena?
- 12 A: It looks, yes, to be e-mails between me and Afraaz.
- 13 Q: Does that appear to be the entire packet of information
 - you provided to Ms. Dudley Helms?
- 15 A: It looks like it. Yeah. I had it in a little manila
 - envelope. I just printed every e-mail that I had in my
- 17 Hot Mail. I didn't have any in my Palmetto Health.
- 18 Q: Did you ever receive a litigation hold notice about Dr.
- 19

- 20 A: I don't know even know what that means. No. I don't
- 21 think so.
- 22 Q: Okay. We before the break were talking about Dr. Irani
- coming back from a period of suspension sometime in
- 24 early 2012. And do you recall that?
- 25 A: Yes.

Page 21 (Pages 81-84)

Page 83 Page 81 1 (Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 4 was marked for identification personal life. 1 2 purposes.) 2 Q: What about with regard to specific patients? Do you 3 Q: I hand you a document that's been marked as Plaintiff's 3 think it's unreliable sometimes to rely on what one Exhibit 4. 4 person tells you about another patient? 4 MS. THOMAS: If you're going to show the witness 5 5 A: Not necessarily. I mean, you have to check out to this and question him about it, then I want the record 6 someone else. You, you know, there's check out every 7 to reflect this is Dr. Irani's printouts of his texts. 7 call, every change of shift. I mean, you're supposed 8 And we have already established that the times on them 8 to check out patients to each other and let them know are not correct. 9 who's on the service. And, I mean, certainly you have 10 MR. ROTHSTEIN: Okay. 10 to trust that. I'm just referring to, you know, in 11 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 11 general wouldn't rely on just one person's account of a 12 Q: You see Plaintiff's Exhibit 4? 12 situation, especially if it was a high-risk situation. A: Yes. I see it. 13 Q: Okay. What if there were different versions of the 14 Q: Okay. This is some text communication between, well, account from one person to the next? What would you do 14 the only image you see here is I think it says Harrison 15 15 to verify that? Goodno and it has a phone number. Do you recognize 16 A: If it was me personally and I was going to be involved 17 that as your phone number at the time? 17 with the patient I would probably go evaluate them myself. I don't recall any specifics about this case 18 A: Yes. 18 19 Q: Okay. 19 other than the fact that it was high risk and it was 20 A: I don't know who's blue and who's white. 20 something that was, you know, a high risk situation, I 21 Q: If you take a look at it for a minute can you tell 21 who's blue and who's white? And I'll direct your 22 O: Okay. From what you've heard from other people about 23 attention to the bottom right-hand image of the screen 23 this particular spine patient, do you believe you're 24 shot. Do you see, it says, what's new pussy cat? 24 qualified to render an opinion about whether the care 25 A: Uh-huh (affirmative response). 25 rendered was appropriate or acceptable just from what Page 82 Page 84 1 Q: Is that something you would have said or Dr. Irani 1 you've heard? would have said? MS. HELMS: Object to the form. 2 3 A: I don't remember. It's a Tom Jones song that, I think 3 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. Afraaz introduced me to at 1801 clinic. It's not a, 4 A: I wouldn't feel comfortable, no. Especially since I 5 it's a terrible song. But I don't know who would have didn't even graduate from an orthopedic residency. I 6 said it. The only thing I can say is that, the only would not feel comfortable saying that. thing that I, looking at these last night was the white BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 7 8 must be Afraaz because he's talking about a patient Q: Okay. If you wanted to verify what one side was saying with foot drop that needed a stat MRI. And I remember about this particular patient, would one way to do 10 that case. So --10 that, one way to do that would be to go to the actual 11 Q: Okay. Tell me what you remember about that case. 11 medical records and look at the medical records. 12 A: Similar to the other case we started to discuss. I 12 Wouldn't you agree with that? MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 13 wasn't part of the exam and was not present for it. 13 14 Everything would have been hearsay. Or, you know, I 14 A: Can you rephrase that please?

15 can't really, I can't really comment on something like 16 that. I would be uncomfortable in commenting on that. 17 Q: Okay. Tell me why you're uncomfortable with hearsay.

A: Because you can't trust gossip. It's just a good rule

19 in general in my experience.

20 Q: Do you believe it's unreliable to rely just simply on 21 what someone tells you about a certain situation?

22 A: When it comes to specific patients or just in general 23 in life? I'm not sure what you mean.

24 Q: Just in general in life.

25 A: I don't, I try and stay out of gossip if I can in my

15 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 16 Q: Yeah. If there's a difference of opinion about this 17 particular spine patient, one way to get a better 18 understanding of which side to believe or to verify 19 would be to go look at at the actual medical record. 20 Do you agree with that? 21 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 22 A: That would be one of many ways to verify. In my specific situation, I always go and evaluate the 23 patients. If there are sicker patients on a service, 24 25 whether it was in orthopedics or in family medicine, I

Page 22 (Pages 85-88)

Page 85 Page 87 would go and evaluate the patient myself, render my own first find out about the suspension? 1 1 2 decision and assessment of the situation. I can't 2 A: I, I remember Justin Hoover telling me that Afraaz was 3 comment on this case because I don't recall ever seeing probably going to be, just a heads up, he's probably 3 4 this patient. So that would be very unusual for me to 4 going to be suspended. I don't remember exactly when 5 comment on that. 5 that was. Sometime around, yeah, it would have been 6 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 6 around Christmastime, in December. 7 Q: Okay. Now, I think what Ms. Thomas was mentioning Q: What about in March of 2012? Did you, when did you earlier was these screen shots were printed out in find out that Afraaz had been suspended again? 9 California on Pacific time. And so the times may be A: That I don't remember. 10 off because I think when they were printed the phone MS. HELMS: Object to the form of the question. 10 11 was physically located in California; okay? So 11 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 12 assuming there's a three-hour difference between 12 Q: Do you remember how you found that out? 13 California time and east coast time, if you will look 13 A: I do not remember that. 14 14 Q: Okay. When did you find out that Dr. Irani was at the bottom left-hand screen shot from Exhibit 4, do 15 you recall receiving an e-mail or a text message from terminated from the program? 15 16 Dr. Irani on February 24th 2012 about a spine patient 16 A: The time frame, I don't recall. I'm sure he told me 17 of Dr. Grabowski's? myself, himself, but I don't remember. 17 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 18 18 Q: Do you know why he was terminated from the program? 19 A: Can you rephrase that or restate that? A: The specifics, no. I mean, I wasn't part of any of 20 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: those hearings or meetings. So I don't know. 20 21 Q: Yeah. Do you recall receiving a text message from Dr. 21 Q: Did you continue to keep in touch with Dr. Irani for a 22 Irani on February 24th 2012 regarding a spine patient while after he left South Carolina? 23 of Dr. Grabowski's? 23 A: Yes. 24 A: I don't remember the specific date. So to answer your 24 Q: When was the last time you saw Dr. Irani prior to today 25 question, no. I do remember this case only because it in person? Page 88 was a higher, you know, again a high risk case that any 1 A: I don't know. We all went out to eat at the restaurant post-op patient who had any issues automatically in 2 by the lake. I don't know if that would have been the general made it a, you know, something that you would 3 last time or not. I don't remember. 4 be on more alert. But I do not remember on February 4 Q: Do you recall seeing Dr. Irani back in South Carolina on Father's Day in 2013? 24th receiving this text. No. 6 Q: Okay. Do you recall receiving a text from Dr. Irani, A: Again, I don't remember the specific dates. Q: Do you remember having breakfast or eating with Dr. not looking at the time, about Dr. Grabowski being pissed at him about a spine patient? Irani --9 A: Specifically, no. I would imagine any attending would A: Yes. Q: -- at the Original Pancake House? 10 be upset about if they had a post-op patient having 11 some sort of issue. 11 A: Yeah. I remember that. 12 Q: All right. Looking at the bottom right-hand, I think 12 Q: How long would you say you spent with Dr. Irani that we established that the blue bubbles are your side of 13 13 14 the conversation and the white ones appear to be Dr. 14 A: It was a morning. Went out to brunch. A few hours. Irani's conversation or side of the conversation. Do 15 I'm not sure. 15 16 you accept that? 16 Q: Do you recall that was, that you discussed that you 17 were getting ready to start or had just started your 17 A: It appears so, but, you know. Family Medicine Residency? 18 Q: Okay. Well, accepting that if you will look at the 18 19 A: I believe so. Yes. 19 bottom right-hand screen shot, the what's new pussy

21

22

25

California?

23 A: That sounds right. Yes.

20

21

22

cat, whoa, whoa, whoa, do you recall texting Dr. Irani

that you would see two of his patients in the morning

24 Q: Now, when Dr. Irani was suspended in December of 2011

through the first of 2012 time frame, when did you

of, I guess it would be March the 1st 2012?

23 A: I don't remember it specifically. No.

20 Q: Okay. Do you recall whether Dr. Irani was getting

24 Q: Okay. At that time did Dr. Irani indicate that he had

ready to start an Emergency Medicine Residency in

filed a lawsuit against anyone in connection with his

2

Page 23 (Pages 89-92)

Page 89

- departure from Palmetto Health USC Residency Program?
- 2 A: I don't remember.
- 3 Q: Do you recall anyone else at the brunch with you and
- 4 Dr. Irani?
- 5 A: It was just the two of us.
- 6 Q: Is that the last time you can recall seeing Dr. Irani
- 7 before today?
- 8 A: Again, we went out to dinner at some point. And he
- 9 joined us. I don't remember exactly when that was. It
- may have been the same weekend. I don't recall.
- 11 Q: Was that at the Rusty Anchor?
- 12 A: Uh-huh (affirmative response). Yes.
- 13 Q: Was your relationship with Dr. Irani at that time
- 14 friendly and cordial?
- 15 A: It's always been friendly and cordial.
- 16 Q: When Dr. Irani was traveling back across the country to
- 17 start his Emergency Medicine rotation, did you have
- 18 communications with him as he was driving across
- 19 country?
- 20 A: I recall, yes, I did.
- 21 Q: At some point did you find out that Dr. Irani had been
- 22 denied medical licensure in California?
- 23 A: Yes. He would have told me at some point.
- 24 Q: Did Dr. Irani request that you provide some type of
- either affidavit or letter of support in connection

- Page 91
- that. Anything in your interactions with Dr. Irani
- 3 in any manner?
- 4 A: He's a very likable guy. I think different people have

during residency that indicated he was unprofessional

- 5 different styles. And he may come across to some as
- 6 being a little bit more laid back. I don't know if I
- 7 would take it to the extent of calling him
- 8 unprofessional.
- Q: When you say laid back, was Dr. Irani ever
- 10 confrontational to you or to anyone in your
- 11 observation?
- 12 A: Confrontational, no. I did find it unusual that he
- would transcribe a conversation going back to the
- Dr. Abell case. I found it unusual that he would
- transcribe a case, or a recording of a conversation
- between him and a resident. But I guess being that he
- was my friend I felt like maybe he was, back was
- against the wall and was trying to protect himself.
- 19 But I did find that unusual.
- 20 Q: Between the, or after the meals either at The Rusty
- 21 Anchor or The Original Pancake House, did you at some
 - point stop communicating with Dr. Irani?
- 23 A: I think as I realized that this was moving towards a
 - legal proceedings, I felt that it was more high risk.
- 25 So I was not always comfortable with the conversations.

Page 92

Page 90

22

24

- with his California medical licensure?
- 2 A: Can you restate that?
- 3 Q: Yeah. At some point did Dr. Irani request that you
- 4 submit or sign or write a letter of recommendation or
- 5 an affidavit in support of his California medical
- 6 licensure?
- 7 A: What I can recall is Afraaz kept asking me if I would,
- 8 you know, support him in moving on to the next step.
- 9 And I always indicated that I would be willing to help
- 10 him move on to the next stage. I specifically remember
- at one point offering to write a letter. And with all
- due respect the response was always kind of vague. And
- so I had a feeling it was probably going to be
- something more along these lines. But I did offer to
- write him a letter, yes, in support of him moving on.
- 16 Q: Would your letter have supported his application for
- 17 licensure in California?
- 18 A: Yes.
- 19 Q: Was there anything in your dealings or observations or
- 20 interactions with Dr. Irani that would have led you to
- 21 believe that Dr. Irani was incompetent to practice
- 22 medicine in the state of California?
- 23 A: In my specific interactions I didn't feel like he was
- 24 incompetent, no.
- 25 Q: Did Dr. Irani ever indicate -- or before we move on to

- 1 O: Okay. What do you mean high risk?
- 2 A: I would consider anything that involves legal
- 3 proceedings high risk.
- 4 Q: High risk for whom?
- 5 A: Everyone.
- 6 Q: Did you believe that you were at risk if you supported
- 7 Dr. Eady, I mean, Dr. Irani in this case?
- 8 A: I think there's a huge conflict of interest in this
- whole situation. So it's very difficult for everyone
- involved. But the fact that I'm still working at the
- 11 hospital is very awkward.
- 12 Q: Did anyone ever instruct you not to have any further
- 13 communication with Dr. Irani?
- 14 A: No.
- 15 Q: Did you fear that you would be retaliated against if
 - you supported Dr. Irani's side of the case?
- 17 A: Can you rephrase that?
- 18 Q: Yeah. Did you feel that you would be retaliated
 - against if you supported Dr. Irani's side of the case?
- 20 A: Not specifically. I would certainly think that would
- be a concern that I would have especially since I'm
- still employed at the hospital. But I don't have any
- 23 specific reason for that.
- Q: Okay. Besides the hospital were you concerned aboutanyone else retaliating against you if you took Dr.

Page 24 (Pages 93-96)

Page 93 Page 95 Irani's side of the case or supported Dr. Irani's side 1 1 Q: Yes. 2 of the case? 2 A: The orthopedic attendings would be Dr. Guy and 3 MS. HELMS: Object to the form of the question. Dr. Mazoue. The, there are several non-operative, MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 4 Dr. Pollack, Dr. Jenkinson, who I don't know if he 5 A: Can you rephrase that? 5 wasn't, I'm not sure he was there at the time. 6 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: Dr. Keesler. Several. But it's different departments. 7 Q: Yeah. Besides the Palmetto Health Hospital System were 7 Q: Okay. But it would include Dr. Guy and Mazoue who are you concerned about any other person potentially also in the same department as Dr. Koon and Dr. Walsh; retaliating against you or your career if you supported is that right? 10 Dr. Irani's side of his case? 10 A: Yes. 11 MS. HELMS: Object to the form of the question. 11 Q: Okay. Did Dr. Koon ever have a conversation with you MS. THOMAS: Objection. 12 12 in which he indicated that he would never talk to Dr. 13 A: I think the fact that I'm still, was and still am 13 Irani about cars? 14 employed at the hospital there is a hierarchy at the 14 A: Can you rephrase that? 15 hospital as in any organization. And as a junior 15 Q: Yeah. Did Dr. Koon ever have a conversation with you 16 member of an organization I think anyone would be in which he said that he would never talk to Dr. Irani 17 concerned about that. about cars? 17 18 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN: 18 A: Cars? Like automobiles? 19 Q: Okay. And I'm asking aside from the hospital aspect of O: Cars. Automobiles. 20 it, what about the Orthopedics Department specifically? 20 A: No. I don't remember that. 21 Were you concerned that anyone from the USC Orthopedics 21 Q: Can you tell me why you left the Orthopedic Residency 22 Department would retaliate against you if you supported Program at the University of South Carolina School of 22 23 Dr. Irani's side of this case? 23 Medicine? 24 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 24 A: I did not want to be a surgeon. 25 A: Again, I can only restate the same thing I already 25 Q: When did you make that determination that you did not Page 94

Page 96

said. So I as a junior member of any organization

would be concerned about that.

3 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:

- 4 Q: Okay. Did Dr. Irani ever indicate to you that he had
- an interest in pursuing a spine fellowship after
- Orthopedic Surgery Residency? 6
- 7 A: That sounds familiar. Yes. That he may have been
- interested in that. 8
- 9 Q: Did you ever indicate to him that you had an interest
- 10 in also pursuing a fellowship in some sub-specialty of
- 11 orthopedics at some point?
- 12 A: I remember being interested in sport medicine,
- orthopedic sports medicine fellowships. I'm sure I 13
- 14 would have told him that at some point but I don't
- 15 recall a specific conversation.
- 16 Q: And I think you indicated earlier still interested in
- 17 non-surgical sports medicine at this point in family
- practice; is that right?
- 19 A: Yes.
- 20 Q: What attendings are involved, would be involved in a
- 21 fellowship at the University of South Carolina School
- of Medicine in non-surgical orthopedic sports medicine? 22
- 23 MS. THOMAS: Object to the form.
- 24 A: Which attendings would be involved?
- 25 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:

- want to be a surgeon?
- A: I think that was an ongoing thing throughout my 2
- 3 residency. I did not enjoy taking call. I did not
- 4 enjoy being in the operating room like I used to be.
- 5 And I still had a love for musculoskeletal. I
- consulted with a lot of people I trust and respect and 6
- 7 came to the determination that I could live without the
- operating room and still pursue something I love. Also 8
- be at home with my children more, and my wife.
- 10 Q: When did you make that career decision that you did not
- 11 want to be an orthopedic surgeon any more?
- 12 A: Officially I remember it was around Thanksgiving of my,
- 13 I guess it would have been my third year.
- 14 Q: So when you finished your rotation with Dr. Eady in the
- fall and into the winter of your PGY 2 year, you still 15
 - wanted to be an orthopedic surgeon; is that correct?
- MS. THOMAS: Object to the form. 17
- 18 A: Again, it was an ongoing thing. I think any time
- 19 anyone works that hard to get to something that you
- 20 probably deny it a little bit yourself. So I don't
- 21 remember specifically when I started thinking about it.
- But I just remember not being myself and not enjoying 22
- it as much.
- 24 BY MR. ROTHSTEIN:
- 25 Q: After Dr. Irani was terminated did your workload in the

Page 25 (Pages 97-100)

Page 99

Page 100

Page 97

- residency department increase? 1
- 2 A: Any time anyone leaves an organization there's going to
- be more work for everyone. Yes.
- 4 Q: Did you ever violate the duty hours restrictions during
- your residency at the Orthopedic Surgery Program at USC
- Palmetto Health?
- 7 A: I don't recall. I would have to look at my log duty
- 9 Q: Did you ever assist in the operating room the morning
- immediately after call during your participation in the 10
- 11 USC Palmetto Health Orthopedic Surgery Residency
- 12 Program?
- 13 A: Post-call?
- 14 Q: Yes.
- 15 A: Yes.
- 16 Q: Would that have been a violation of the duty hour
- restrictions as you understand them?
- 18 A: Not necessarily.
- 19 Q: Is it possible that that would have been a violation of
- 20 duty hour restrictions as you understand them?
- 21 A: It would have depended how late the case went how late
- 22 I was there. There were several times where you could
- 23 still go to the operating room the morning of and they
- 24 had worked it out such that you could still do the case
- that you had worked up, worked hard the night before to 25

- 1 Q: Have you ever logged inaccurate duty hours?
- 3 Q: Has anyone in the residency program ever told you,
- quote, make it work with regard to your duty hour
- reporting? 5

10

- 6 A: Not that I recall.
- Q: Did you ever witness any of your fellow residents
- violate the duty hour restrictions?
- A: I wasn't interested in what other people's duty hours
 - were. I don't think anyone really cared that much
- 11 about it. So, you know, you were there to learn and do
- 12 cases. So I don't, I couldn't comment on other
- 13 people's duty hours.
- 14 Q: How much credit did you receive for your medical
- 15 training when you transferred into the Family Medicine
- 16 Residency Program?
- 17 A: How much credit? I mean, I guess I'll graduate, they
- 18 credited specific rotations. I'm going to graduate a
- 19 couple months early. I don't, I don't have an exact
- 20 number.
- 21 Q: When you started family medicine, the Family Medicine
- 22 Residency Program did you come in as a PGY 2 or a PGY
- 23
- 24 A: Kind of a hybrid I guess. PGY 1, 2. I advanced, you
- know, sooner than others might. The only reason I know

Page 98

- get ready and then participate in the case and still go
- 2 on. But if I recall it was by noon or something. It
- 3 worked out. They had worked it out so that you could
- 4 still be present for at least one case and not violate.
- But I would have to look at my specific duty hours. 6 Q: Okay. Are you aware of a continuity of care exception
- to the requirement that you not work more than 24 hours 7
- in a row? 8
- 9 A: Can you rephrase that?
- 10 Q: Yeah. Are you aware of the continuity of care
- 11 exception to the duty hour restriction that you're not
- 12 supposed to work more than 24 hours in a row of duty?
- 13 A: I don't know if this is what you are referring to. I
- 14 know that if there was like an emergency or something
- 15 with a critically ill patient you could stay longer to
- 16 ensure continuity of care if that's what you're
- 17 referring to. I'm not sure. But that is something
- that exists as I'm aware of it.
- 19 Q: Is it possible that you violated duty hour restrictions
- during your orthopedic residency? 20
- 21 A: I'm not going to speculate. I would have to look at my
- 22 duty hour log.
- 23 Q: Okay. Did you ever report any duty hour violations on
- 24 your duty hour log?
- 25 A: I would have to look at my log.

- that is when I log in to New Innovations towards the
- end of the year it will say I'm the next level. But, I 2
- 3 mean, I was still technically a PGY 1, I guess.
- 4 Q: And what time of the year did you actually stop working
- as a PGY 3 in the Orthopedic Surgery Residency Program
- in 2012 or 2013? 6
- 7 A: When did I stop working as an orthopedic resident?
- 8 Q: Yes.
- 9 A: I continued until the end of third year because I
- wasn't going to start until July 1st in Family 10
- 11 Medicine. So I think I took a week off in between. So
- 12 sometime at the end of June. And then I would have
- started in July with Family Medicine. 13
- 14 Q: Okay.
- 15 (Plaintiff's Exhibit Number 5 was marked for identification
- 17 Q: Show you Exhibit 5. Do you recognize Exhibit 5 or at
- 18 least the first part of Exhibit 5?
- 19 A: Yes.
- 20 Q: Okay. Do you recall receiving an e-mail from Dr. Koon
- 21 on or about February 6, 2013 about your informing
- Dr. Koon and Dr. Walsh that you desired to discontinue 22
- 23 your orthopedic training?
- 24 A: I don't remember the specific e-mail. I do remember
- that he told me that he had to officially send me